GUIDING PRINCIPLES FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF A
CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK FOR POSTGRADUATE DISTANCE
EDUCATION IN PROJECT MANAGEMENT

A Dissertation submitted by

Barrie James Todhunter

DipArch QIT BArch Qld GDipProjMgt QIT MProjMgt QUT MBA USQ

for the award of

Doctor of Philosophy

2009
Abstract

This study examines an existing postgraduate distance education program in project management in the setting of a regional university (University of Southern Queensland), and explores ways in which the program can be reconceptualised so that it aligns with validated pedagogical principles. By means of a comprehensive and in-depth analysis, the case study approach holistically explores the organisational context within which the program exists, the pedagogical frameworks by which the program is offered, and the educational setting within which students undertake their learning tasks and activities. Activity Theory has been used to undertake the study which has been guided by the question:

What are the guiding principles for the development of a conceptual framework for postgraduate distance education in project management?

The study progressively explores the contextual issues that influence postgraduate distance education for project management, the characteristics and circumstances of the learners, and the pedagogical frameworks, principles and practices guiding postgraduate distance education for project management in the case study setting. Data have been collected consistent with the principles of grounded theory through document analysis, semi-structured interviews, a web-based survey and focus group sessions. Data analysis has taken place iteratively with the findings from each stage guiding the collection and analysis of data in the subsequent stages. From the overall findings of the data analysis, key principles have been identified to guide future development of a conceptual framework for postgraduate project management distance education in the University.

The findings from this study are embodied in a matrix of 9 key principles and 16 sub-principles, and recommendations flowing from those principles are summarised below:

- Distance education teaching and learning must be acknowledged as a core function of the University consistent with its vision, mission and values;
• *Constructive alignment* must be achieved across all administrative and academic functions of the University involved in the delivery of distance education;

• *Postgraduate teaching and learning* at a distance must be recognised as a discrete component of teaching and learning with specific characteristics and resource requirements;

• Administrative and academic policies, regulations and practices must incorporate genuine *openness* and *flexibility* as essential attributes of postgraduate distance education;

• Academic staff must be adequately trained and resourced to teach postgraduate programs at a distance;

• Administrative, teaching and learning practices should evolve from a *student-centred learning community*, driven by an understanding of the postgraduate distance education students in the project management programs, and their needs and objectives as lifelong learners;

• Relevant *graduate attributes* should be defined for postgraduate students in the project management programs, and learning tasks, activities and assessment should be structured towards development of those attributes;

• Postgraduate distance education students should engage in *interactive* and *collaborative* learning tasks and activities in order to attain high-level intellectual skills and abilities that are required for project management practice;

• Postgraduate distance education students should engage in *situated learning*, where tasks and activities take place in authentic project management contexts that respect students’ individual learning settings and circumstances;

• Postgraduate programs in distance education should be structured with regard to curriculum and assessment to deliver *learning outcomes* that are endorsed by all stakeholders in the project management programs, both internal and external to the University.
Certification of dissertation

I certify that the ideas, experimental work, results, analyses, software and conclusions reported in this dissertation are entirely my own effort, except where otherwise acknowledged. I also certify that the work is original and has not been previously submitted for any other award, except where otherwise acknowledged.

__________________________________ _____________________
Signature of Candidate Date

Endorsement

__________________________________ _____________________
Signature of Principal Supervisor/s Date

__________________________________ _____________________
Signature of Associate Supervisor Date
Foreword

After thirty-years in industry as an architect and project manager, the author commenced a temporary teaching position at the University of Southern Queensland and this subsequently evolved into a new career with responsibility for a Master’s-level project management program. A desire to provide the optimal student learning experience revealed the complexity facing a new academic in providing postgraduate distance education students with learning outcomes that match students’ expectations and those of the broader professional community. The author inherited a teaching and learning model which at the time was perceived to represent ‘best practice’ for postgraduate distance education, but was also aware of students’ dissatisfaction with their experiences and learning outcomes. Many students were unable to complete their studies because of the circumstances under which they studied and the constraints of the learning environment, but the view of many stakeholders was that this reflected real life and postgraduate study was a training ground for practice in an unforgiving workplace.

The author subsequently adopted a more flexible and student-centred model and saw the students as co-learners. Personal observation of the conflicts that students encountered throughout their studies prompted a desire to find better ways of assisting students to achieve their personal goals and learning objectives, and to enjoy their learning experience along the way.

As there is no recognised theoretical framework by which postgraduate project management education can be offered at a distance, this study addresses that gap. Over the course of this study from 2002 to 2008, internal and external forces brought about considerable changes to the organisational, political and financial landscapes within the University, and a major objective of this study has been to contribute to the debate on how we, as a university community, can provide a more effective and rewarding learning experience for postgraduate distance education students in project management.
Acknowledgements

A study of this scale does not eventuate without contributions from many people. Colleagues, friends and family members have provided support, knowledge and encouragement that have been essential for it to come to fruition. Of the many people who have provided assistance over the years, the following have made special contributions that I would like to acknowledge:

- Professor Glen Postle who was kind enough to agree to act as principal supervisor and who has patiently guided the study around the pitfalls that lie in the path of doctoral students, and who has gently nudged the project in the right directions without unduly influencing the processes nor the outcomes, for which I accept full responsibility;
- Dr Mehryar Nooriafshar who has patiently provided support and guidance as associate supervisor for a research project which has extended over many years;
- staff of the Faculty of Education who have provided administrative and academic support, especially during the period when the research proposal was being finalised for scrutiny and critique;
- my colleagues in the Faculty of Business who have provided moral support over the years, encouraging me when progress was slow, and who have willingly participated in data collection stages;
- my students in the project management program who have enthusiastically shared their learning experiences over the years;
- my family and friends who have known when to provide active encouragement and when to provide quiet space as the pace changed along the way;
- my son Lee who has missed his fishing companion for many years; and
- most especially, my wife Susan who has lovingly and selflessly allowed me the time and opportunities to pursue my studies without revealing any sense of the sacrifices that she has made over the years, and who has as much entitlement to this award as I do.
# Table of Contents

Abstract ................................................................................................................. i  
Certification of dissertation ................................................................................. iii  
Endorsement .......................................................................................................... iii  
Foreword ............................................................................................................... iv  
Acknowledgements ............................................................................................... v  

1 Introduction ....................................................................................................... 1  
  1.1 Overview of the study .................................................................................. 1  
  1.2 Impetus for the study .................................................................................. 1  
  1.3 The project management program ............................................................... 3  
  1.4 The teaching and learning context ............................................................... 6  
  1.5 Research problem and questions ................................................................ 8  
  1.6 Focus of the study ...................................................................................... 9  
  1.7 Significance of the study ............................................................................ 12  
  1.8 Delimitations and limitations of the study .................................................. 13  
  1.9 Structure of the dissertation ...................................................................... 14  

2 Literature review .............................................................................................. 17  
  2.1 Introduction ................................................................................................ 17  
  2.2 Approach to carrying out the literature review ........................................... 17  
  2.3 Learning, teaching and higher education .................................................... 18  
      2.3.1 Learning and teaching ....................................................................... 18  
      2.3.2 Teaching and learning in higher education ....................................... 21  
  2.4 Postgraduate education .............................................................................. 23  
  2.5 Distance education ..................................................................................... 27  
      2.5.1 Education at a distance ..................................................................... 27  
      2.5.2 Principles of distance education ....................................................... 32  
      2.5.3 Barriers to distance education ........................................................... 36  
      2.5.4 Distance education at USQ ................................................................. 37  
  2.6 Project management and professional education ........................................ 41  
      2.6.1 Distance education for professional development .......................... 45  
  2.7 Conclusions and summary ......................................................................... 45  

3 Research design, methodology and data collection techniques .................. 47  
  3.1 Theoretical approach .................................................................................. 47  
      3.1.1 Purpose of the study ......................................................................... 47  
      3.1.2 The research paradigm ..................................................................... 49  
      3.1.3 Quantitative and qualitative methodologies ..................................... 51  
      3.1.4 Quality of research outcomes ......................................................... 54  
      3.1.5 Boundaries of the study .................................................................. 56  
  3.2 Research design ........................................................................................... 58  
      3.2.1 Conceptual and theoretical framework to guide the study .............. 58  
      3.2.2 Activity theory (AT) ......................................................................... 59  
      3.2.3 Stages of the design ......................................................................... 63  
  3.3 Methods and techniques of data collection ................................................ 68  
      3.3.1 Collection of data ............................................................................ 68  
      3.3.2 Role of the researcher ...................................................................... 68
Data analysis, findings and guiding principles ......................... 100

4.1 Introduction and overview ..................................................... 100

4.2 Stage 1 – Analysis of documents and artefacts from USQ ............... 102

4.2.1 Background ........................................................................... 103

4.2.2 Student expectations ............................................................... 105

4.2.3 Lack of flexibility .................................................................... 106

4.2.4 Teaching and learning framework ............................................. 109

4.2.5 University vision, mission and values ....................................... 111

4.2.6 Rules, regulations and policies .................................................. 115

4.2.7 Learning and teaching support .................................................. 116

4.2.8 Academic programs, courses and modes of study ....................... 116

4.2.9 Expertise in distance education ............................................... 117

4.2.10 Assessment policies ................................................................. 120

4.2.11 Summary of document analysis .............................................. 121

4.3 Stage 2 - Semi-structured interviews ........................................... 122

4.3.1 Semi-structured interviews ....................................................... 122

4.3.2 Phase 1 of interviews ............................................................... 123

4.3.3 Phase 2 of interviews ............................................................... 123

4.3.4 Findings from analysis of interviews in Phases 1 and 2 ................... 124

4.3.5 Findings from initial phases of interviews .................................... 129

4.3.6 Phase 3 of the interviews .......................................................... 130

4.3.7 Use of Leximancer software for analysis of interview data .......... 130

4.3.8 Nomination of user-defined ‘seeds’ in Leximancer analysis .......... 131

4.3.9 Manual analysis of the data from all interviews ......................... 132
4.3.10 Analysis of interview with ACA-001 ........................................ 133
4.3.11 Analysis of interview with ACA-002 ........................................ 134
4.3.12 Analysis of interview with ACA-005 ........................................ 137
4.3.13 Analysis of interview with ACA-007 ........................................ 140
4.3.14 Analysis of interview with ACA-009 ........................................ 142
4.3.15 Analysis of interview with STU-001 ........................................ 144
4.3.16 Analysis of interview with STU-002 ........................................ 146
4.3.17 Narrative summary of analysis of disturbances by AT framework. 148
4.3.18 Summary of outcomes of interview stage .................................. 151

4.4 Stage 3 – Students’ responses to the web-based survey ..................... 151
4.4.1 Analysis of students’ responses in the web-based survey ................. 151
4.4.2 Analysis of survey data in Part A ............................................ 152
4.4.3 Analysis of survey data in Part B ............................................ 159
4.4.4 Summary of findings from analysis of students’ survey responses . 159

4.5 Stage 3 – Students’ comments in the web-based survey ..................... 161
4.5.1 Analysis of students’ comments ............................................. 161
4.5.2 Analysis 1 .............................................................................. 162
4.5.3 Analysis 2 .............................................................................. 183
4.5.4 Summary of findings from the survey analysis ............................ 184

4.6 Stage 4 - Analysis of data from focus groups ................................ 185
4.6.1 Derivation of focus group topics ............................................. 185
4.6.2 Analysis of nominal group data ............................................. 190
4.6.3 Focus group for Strand A: The learning institution ...................... 191
4.6.4 Focus group for Strand B: The academic facilitator ...................... 193
4.6.5 Focus group for Strand C: The peer group ................................ 195
4.6.6 Focus group for Strand D: The student’s workplace ................. 197
4.6.7 Focus group for Strand E: Learning resources ............................ 199
4.6.8 Focus group for Strand F: Assessment ..................................... 201
4.6.9 Findings from analysis of focus group data related to AT nodes ... 203

4.7 Generation of guiding principles.................................................. 203
4.7.1 Guiding principles ................................................................. 203
4.7.2 A framework for analysing the focus group suggestions .............. 204
4.7.3 The DELPHE framework of guiding principles ...................... 204
4.7.4 Mapping of nominal group suggestions ................................... 212
4.7.5 Generation of principles ....................................................... 212
4.7.6 Collation of the DELPHE principles ...................................... 213
4.7.7 Application of the DELPHE principles .................................... 215
4.7.8 Summary of the key principles in the DELPHE framework ....... 215
4.7.9 Holistic nature of the DELPHE framework ............................. 217
4.7.10 Alignment between Key Principles A to F .............................. 219
4.7.11 Alignment between Key Principles 1 to 3 .............................. 219

4.8 Summary ................................................................................. 220

5 Interpretation, conclusions and recommendations .......................... 221
5.1 Introduction ............................................................................. 221
5.2 Application of the DELPHE principles in the University setting .... 221
5.3 The organisational context ....................................................... 222
5.4 Key Principle A ....................................................................... 223
5.4.1 Key principle A – Community building ................................. 224
5.4.2 Sub-principle A1 ................................................................. 231
5.4.2.1 Develop lifelong relationships with students at a personal level 232
5.4.2.2 Provide academic and non-academic support facilities to meet students’ needs ...................................................................................... 233
5.4.2.3 Allocate financial and human resources to improve academic staffing profiles and development of teaching skills ......................... 234
5.4.2.4 Define and implement rules, regulations and policies that are pedagogically and procedurally consistent with organisational objectives . 236
5.4.3 Sub-principle A2 .................................................................. 236
5.4.3.1 Focus on humanistic rather than mechanistic dimensions of the institution ...................................................................................... 237
5.4.3.2 Define the role and status of distance education in the hierarchy of organisational priorities .............................................................. 237
5.4.3.3 Align distance education teaching roles and activities with organisational priorities .............................................................. 238
5.4.3.4 Define quality standards for learning resources ................. 238
5.4.3.5 Foster communities of practice across the organisation at all levels 239
5.5 Key Principle B ......................................................................... 239
5.5.1 Key Principle B – Learner-centredness ........................................ 240
5.5.2 Sub-principle B1 .................................................................. 244
5.5.2.1 Define expectations for teaching roles and practice ........... 245
5.5.2.2 Engage academic staff in distance education teaching mode ..... 245
5.5.2.3 Recruit, develop, recognise, promote and reward academic staff relative to learning outcomes ...................................................... 246
5.5.2.4 Recognise and reward staff for practical industry knowledge and experience .................................................................. 247
5.5.2.5 Incorporate student feedback into teaching practices .......... 247
5.5.3 Sub-principle B2 .................................................................. 247
5.5.3.1 Adopt a developmental approach to learning .................. 248
5.5.3.2 Achieve a balance between pedagogy and discipline-based content 250
5.5.3.3 Foster academic communities of practice to provide mentorship and achieve consistency across course and program levels .............. 251
5.5.4 Sub-principle B3 .................................................................. 251
5.5.4.1 Avoid ineffective use of students’ time ...................... 252
5.5.4.2 Make allowance for technological constraints in students’ personal learning environment .................................................. 253
5.6 Key Principle C ......................................................................... 253
5.6.1 Key Principle C – Collaborative learning ...................................... 254
5.6.2 Sub-principle C2 .................................................................. 256
5.6.2.1 Create interactive, social and collaborative learning environments 257
5.6.2.2 Foster student communities of practice to engage all students including those on the periphery ........................................ 258
5.6.2.3 Utilise technology to foster virtual learning environments and online social presence ........................................ 260
5.6.3 Sub-principle C3 .................................................................. 260
5.6.3.1 Foster interaction with other students and industry practitioners 261
5.6.3.2 Actively participate in social learning environments for students such as discussion boards.................................................. 262

5.7 Key Principle D ................................................................................................................................. 263
5.7.1 Key Principle D – Situated learning ............................................................................................... 264
5.7.2 Sub-principle D1 ........................................................................................................................... 267

5.7.2.1 Provide a flexible learning environment to accommodate student workplace commitments, .................................................................... 268
5.7.2.2 Provide adequate support to address conflicts between study and workplace commitments ........................................................................ 268
5.7.2.3 Establish a relationship with employer organisations to foster work/study/life balance ........................................................................ 270

5.7.3 Sub-principle D2 ........................................................................................................................... 271

5.7.3.1 Use the workplace as an environment for learning and assessment 271
5.7.3.2 Recognise and build on students’ workplace-related learning and skills 274

5.7.4 Sub-principle D3 ........................................................................................................................... 274

5.7.4.1 Engage industry and workplace in learning tasks and activities ............................................. 275
5.7.4.2 Provide acknowledgement and support for employers to create a study-friendly workplace ........................................................................ 275

5.8 Key Principle E ................................................................................................................................. 276

5.8.1 Key Principle E – Learning support ............................................................................................... 277
5.8.2 Sub-principle E1 ........................................................................................................................... 279

5.8.2.1 Provide financial resources to develop learning resources with a focus on quality rather than quantity ............................................................ 280

5.8.3 Sub-principle E2 ........................................................................................................................... 281

5.8.3.1 Provide access to flexible, current, relevant and varied learning resources to suit students’ context ........................................................................ 281
5.8.3.2 Align learning resources with learning tasks and activities ................................................. 284
5.8.3.3 Learning resources should reflect student progression and learning outcomes at course and program level ........................................................................ 285

5.8.4 Sub-principle E3 ........................................................................................................................... 286

5.8.4.1 Encourage students to define and develop their own learning resource needs .......................................................... 286
5.8.4.2 Relate learning resources to the workplace .............................................................................. 287

5.9 Key Principle F ................................................................................................................................. 287

5.9.1 Key Principle F – Learning outcomes ........................................................................................... 288
5.9.2 Sub-principle F1 ........................................................................................................................... 291

5.9.2.1 Establish consistent policies on assessment requirements across courses and programs .................................................................................. 291
5.9.2.2 Provide flexibility to accommodate study/work/life conflicts .................................................. 292

5.9.3 Sub-principle F2 ........................................................................................................................... 293

5.9.3.1 Align assessment with course and program objectives to foster higher-order learning .................................................................................. 294
5.9.3.2 Set open-ended assessment based on real-life cases from the workplace ........................................ 294
5.9.3.3 Set realistic assessment workloads ............................................................................................. 296
5.9.3.4 Set consistent, relevant and flexible assessment across courses and programs 297
5.9.4 Sub-principle F3 ........................................................................................................... 297
5.9.4.1 Provide timely and relevant developmental feedback to students 298
5.10 Key Principles 1 to 3 .................................................................................................... 299
5.11 Key Principle 1 – The organisational context ................................................................. 299
5.12 Key Principle 2 – The pedagogical framework .............................................................. 304
5.13 Key Principle 3 – The educational setting ..................................................................... 309
5.14 Summary of study outcomes .......................................................................................... 313
5.14.1 Recommendations for policy-makers and administrators ........................................ 314
5.14.2 Recommendations for academic staff members ......................................................... 314
5.15 Limitations of study ....................................................................................................... 315
5.16 Recommendations for further research ......................................................................... 316
5.17 Concluding thoughts ..................................................................................................... 316

LIST OF REFERENCES ........................................................................................................ 318

APPENDICES ...................................................................................................................... 349

Appendix 1: Questions for Phases 1 to 3 of the semi-structured interviews ... 350
Appendix 2: Part A of survey instrument ............................................................................ 351
Appendix 3: Part B of survey instrument ............................................................................ 355
Appendix 4: List of nominal group sessions and participants ............................................. 362
Appendix 5: Example of comparison of initial interviews .................................................... 364
Appendix 6: Example of initial coding of interviews carried out in relation to project management education ................................................................. 370
Appendix 7: Example (part only) of descriptive statistical analysis of survey - Part A.1 Background ........................................................................................................... 371
Appendix 8: Summary of findings from statistical analysis of survey responses ................. 372
Appendix 9: Ranking of statements based on level of disturbance .................................... 377
Appendix 10: Ranking of statements based on level of importance .................................. 378
Appendix 11: Full list of suggestions generated by focus group members for Strands A to F ................................................................................................................... 379
Appendix 12: Glossary of acronyms and abbreviations ..................................................... 388

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1: Goodyear’s model of open and distance learning ............................................. 34
Figure 3.1: Basic components of an activity system .............................................................. 61
Figure 3.2: Stages of the research design ............................................................................ 64
Figure 4.1: DELPHE Framework of guiding principles ....................................................... 218
Figure 5.1: Dimensions of flexibility ................................................................................. 308
LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1: Constructivist view of learning related to postgraduate distance education .......................................................................................... 21
Table 2.2: Models of Distance Education ................................................................................................................................. 31
Table 3.1: Characteristics of qualitative research and application to study ................................................................. 53
Table 3.2: Operationalisation of Activity Theory in the study ......................................................................................... 60
(Mwanza & Engeström, 2005, p. 458) ................................................................................................................... 61
Table 3.3: Research stages and outcomes .................................................................................................................. 67
Table 3.4: Details of five interviewees in Phases 1 and 2 .............................................................................................. 72
Table 3.5: Details of interviewees in Phase 3 ................................................................................................................. 74
Table 3.6: Structure of the web-based survey ........................................................................................................... 79
Table 3.7: Extract to illustrate Part A of the survey instrument ................................................................................. 80
Table 3.8: Example of survey statements and possible responses ............................................................................. 81
Table 3.9: Mapping of survey questions to AT ........................................................................................................ 83
Table 3.10: Survey sections and AT nodes .................................................................................................................. 86
Table 3.11: Sample of indicative scoring of survey responses .................................................................................. 90
Table 3.12: Nominal group topics and strands ............................................................................................................... 96
Table 4.1: Data collection and analysis to answer research questions ................................................................. 100
Table 4.2: Summary of key dates in USQ history ........................................................................................................ 103
Table 4.3: Ranked concepts for all interviews using selected seeds ........................................................................... 131
Table 4.4: Gender of respondents ............................................................................................................................. 153
Table 4.5: Age brackets of respondents .................................................................................................................... 153
Table 4.6: English native speakers .......................................................................................................................... 154
Table 4.7: Nature of disability affecting studies ....................................................................................................... 154
Table 4.8: Family commitments affecting studies ..................................................................................................... 155
Table 4.9: Work commitments affecting studies ......................................................................................................... 155
Table 4.10: Employment status during studies ........................................................................................................ 155
Table 4.11: Duration as Project Manager .................................................................................................................. 156
Table 4.12: Role level as Project Manager ................................................................................................................ 156
Table 4.13: Prior undergraduate Bachelors degree .................................................................................................. 157
Table 4.14: Highest level of study by DE ..................................................................................................................... 157
Table 4.15: Source of funding for studies .................................................................................................................. 158
Table 4.16: Residential location during DE study ................................................................................................. 158
Table 4.17: Fifteen most-common concepts associated with disturbances in students’ comments .............................................................................................................. 183
Table 4.18: Comparison of ranked findings from analyses 1 and 2 ........................................................................... 186
Table 4.19: Summary of sources of disturbance and dimensions of students’ learning experience .............................................................................................................. 188
Table 4.20: Topics used as a structure for the focus groups ...................................................................................... 190
Table 4.21: Suggestions derived from the nominal group sessions ........................................................................ 191
Table 4.22: Suggestions to address disturbances related to the learning institution ........................................... 192
Table 4.23: Suggestions to address disturbances related to the academic facilitator ............................................... 193
Table 4.24: Suggestions to address disturbances related to the student peer group ............................................. 196
Table 4.25: Suggestions to address disturbances related to the student’s workplace ............................................. 197
Table 4.26: Suggestions to address disturbances related to the learning resources. 199
Table 4.27: Suggestions to address disturbances related to assessment .................. 201
Table 4.28: Mapping of nominal group suggestions to Goodyear’s pedagogical framework ............................................................................................................. 206
Table 4.29: DELPHE Principles derived from mapping of nominal group suggestions to Goodyear’s pedagogical framework ............................................................................................................. 209
Table 4.30: Collation of DELPHE principles from Table 4.29 ................................. 211