

The environmental regulation of mining: an international comparison

by

Noeleen McNamara
B Com, LLB, LLM, ATCL

A Dissertation submitted
For the award of a
Doctorate in Philosophy within the
School of Law of the
University of Southern Queensland
2009

CERTIFICATION OF DISSERTATION

I certify that the ideas, experimental work, results, analyses, software and conclusions reported in this dissertation are entirely by own effort, except where otherwise acknowledged. I also certify that the work is original and has not been previously submitted for any other award, except where otherwise acknowledged.

.....
Signature of Candidate

.....
Date

ENDORSEMENT

.....
Signature of Supervisor

.....
Date

.....
Signature of Supervisor

.....
Date

ABSTRACT

Over the past 15 years, significant sectors of the mining industry have undertaken the Global Mining Initiative. This was followed by an extensive program called the Mining, Minerals and Sustainable Development Project. These self regulatory mechanisms require 'beyond compliance' environmental behaviour, whether companies are operating in the developed or the developing world. Reviewing case studies of gold mines operated by the 'top tier' transnational mining companies in Queensland, Papua New Guinea and Tanzania, this thesis addresses whether these and other self regulatory mechanisms are more important than formal legislation in motivating compliance with environmental laws for these mining companies.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to sincerely thank and acknowledge the many hours spent by my Principal Supervisor, Associate Professor Geoff Cockfield in developing this thesis. Dr Cockfield's erudite comments and suggestions were of immense value. I am indebted to him for taking on this supervisory role at such a busy time in his professional career.

I would also like to acknowledge the work of my Associate Supervisor, Dr Des Taylor, for his many useful suggestions and thank him for always making himself available to answer my queries and provide support. Thanks are also given to Dr Donald Gifford, my Supervisor at The University of Queensland, for his painstaking review of previous drafts of this thesis.

I also express deep appreciation to my Mother and late Grandmother for their many years of support and sacrifice throughout my school and undergraduate years. It is a deep regret that my Father and Grandmother are not able to see the culmination of their aspirations for me.

I would also like to acknowledge the patience of my sons, Alex and Will McCann, and of my friends with this thesis. In particular I would like to thank Robert Mason and Alex Ihlenfeldt for their many years of enquiring about the progress of my thesis!

Dr Bill Crane has been instrumental in my persevering with this thesis. He provided guidance in redirecting my initial topic and wise counsel throughout the process. I am deeply indebted to him for his nurturing, wisdom and support.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>Abstract</i>	i
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	iii
Chapter One SCOPE AND OBJECTIVES	1
1.1. Introduction	1
1.2. The Policy Problem	2
1.3. Research Problem and Objectives of Thesis	6
1.4. Structure of Thesis	7
1.5. Study Sites	8
1.6. Scope of Thesis	10
1.7. Contribution of the Thesis	12
Chapter Two REVIEW OF SELF REGULATORY MECHANISMS	13
2.1. Introduction	13
2.2. The Importance of Self Regulatory Mechanisms	13
2.3. The Growth of Environmental Consciousness	14
2.3.1. The Origins of Environmental Consciousness	15
2.3.2. Developing Environmental Consciousness: the first wave	18
2.3.3. Developing Environmental Consciousness: the second wave	20
2.4. The Rise of Non-Government Organisations	24
2.4.1. The Origins of Non-Government Organisations	24
2.4.2. Modern Non-Government Organisations	26
2.4.3. The Role of Non-Government Organisations in the International arena	27
2.4.4. The Move Towards Professionalism	28
2.4.5. Non-Government Organisations and the Mining Industry ..	30
2.5. The Development of an International Environmental Law Framework	32
2.5.1. Pre-Stockholm	33
2.5.2. United Nations Conference on the Human Environment ..	35
2.5.3. The Brundtland Report	36
2.5.4. United Nations Conference on Environment & Development	38
2.5.5. The Johannesburg Summit	42
2.6. The World Bank	44
2.7. Global Initiatives concerning the Environmental Impacts of Mining	46
2.7.1. The Global Mining Initiative	46
2.7.2. The Mining, Minerals & Sustainable Development Project	48
2.7.3. The Global Mining Initiative Conference	49
2.7.4. The International Council of Mining and Metals	50
2.8. The Global Reporting Initiative	52
2.9. The Global Compact	55
2.10. Conclusion	56

Chapter Three	THE NATIONAL REGULATORY SYSTEMS	58
3.1.	Introduction	58
3.2.	The Constitutions of Australia, Papua New Guinea & Tanzania ..	60
3.2.1.	Australia	60
3.2.2.	Papua New Guinea	64
3.2.3.	Tanzania	65
3.2.4.	Contrast between Papua New Guinea & Tanzania	65
3.3.	International influences on Australia, Tanzania & Papua New Guinea's Environmental laws	67
3.3.1.	Australia	68
3.3.2.	Tanzania	73
3.3.3.	Papua New Guinea	79
3.4.	Third party standing	83
3.4.1.	Standing at common law in Australia	83
3.4.2.	Environmental Protection Act 1994	87
3.4.3.	Environment Protection & Biodiversity Conservation Act 1999	89
3.4.4.	Costs	90
3.4.5.	Papua New Guinea	92
3.5.	Conclusion	95
	Comparative Table of Environmental Legislation	97
Chapter Four	GEO-POLITICAL BACKGROUND	109
4.1.	Introduction	109
4.2.	The Economic Context & the North-South Divide	109
4.3.	The Political Environment	112
4.3.1.	Global Competition in the Global Economy	113
4.3.2.	Corruption	115
4.3.3.	The Power & Influence of TNCs	118
4.4.	Conclusion	121
Chapter Five	CASE STUDIES	122
5.1.	Introduction	122
5.2.	Tanzania	122
5.2.1.	Bulyanhulu Mine	125
5.2.2.	Geita Gold Mine	134
5.3.	Papua New Guinea	143
5.3.1.	Ok Tedi Mine	143
5.3.2.	Lihir Gold	153
5.4.	Queensland	165
5.4.1.	Cannington	165
5.4.2.	Osborne Mine	171
	Comparative Table of Mining Regulations	175
Chapter Six	CONCLUSIONS	179
6.1.	Response to Legal Requirements	180

6.2.	The Cultural Determinants	180
6.3.	Self Regulation	181
6.4.	Broad Issues and Recommendations	182
6.4.1.	Corporate morality	182
6.4.2.	Environmental morality	182
6.4.3.	Economics	183
6.4.4.	Politics	183
6.4.5.	Human rights	183
6.4.6.	Law	184
 APPENDICES		 186
Appendix 1-1	Potential environmental impacts of mineral exploration & development	186
Appendix 1-2	A history of the environmental impacts of mining	188
Appendix 1-3	Forms of pollution covered by mining licence conditions	193
Appendix 2-1	The rise & fall of environmental consciousness from 1970	195
Appendix 2-2	World Wide Fund for Nature – Corporate program	197
Appendix 2-3	North Queensland Conservation Council – Recommendations on the Cannington Mine	198
Appendix 2-4	Global Environmental Conventions	205
Appendix 2-5	Recommendations of the Mining, Minerals & Sustainable Development Project	206
Appendix 2-6	Global Reporting Initiative – G3 Reporting Guidelines	208
Appendix 2-7	Can mining be sustainable?	209
Appendix 5-1	Operational Statistics for the Bulyanhulu Mine, Tanzania	210
Appendix 5-2	Operational Statistics for the Geita Gold Mine, Tanzania	211
Appendix 5-3	Ok Tedi Mining Ltd, Mine Waste Management Project, Risk Assessment and Supporting Documents	212
Appendix 5-4	Operational Statistics for Lihir Gold Ltd, PNG	216
Appendix 5-5	Lihir Gold Ltd’s publication about Deep Sea Tailings Placement	217
Appendix 5-6	Operational Statistics for the Cannington Mine, Queensland	218
Appendix 5-7	Operational Statistics for the Osborne Mine, Queensland	219
Bibliography	220