

University of Southern Queensland

**Teachers' Language Ideologies and Classroom Practices
in English Bilingual Education:
An Ethnographic Case Study of a Senior High School
in Central Java, Indonesia**

A dissertation submitted by

**Sri Wuli Fitriati
S.Pd. (B.A. English language education)
M.Pd. (M.Ed. English language education)**

for the award of

Doctor of Philosophy

2015

ABSTRACT

This dissertation reports on a study that investigated subject teachers' language ideologies of English, conducted *during* the implementation of the government's policy on the use of English alongside Indonesian in teaching Mathematics and Science and habitual language use of English in selected government-owned schools. This was an ethnographic case study of a state Senior High School in a city in the province of Central Java, Indonesia.

This study identified and examined subject teachers' language ideologies about English to gain insight into their language practices in classrooms in enacting the government's promotion of the use of English in school. Central to the study was exploration of links between subject teachers' English language ideologies, classroom practices, and the contexts that shape both of these. Drawing on Kroskrity (2010), I used the concept language ideologies as the conceptual framework of this study. Language ideologies, or beliefs about language, play a powerful role in the English bilingual education practice in the school context.

The participants were teachers of Mathematics, Biology, Chemistry, Geography, and Information and Communication Technology, and some school executives to enhance the extent and depth of convictions about English language use. This study was carried out using multiple methods of data collection: whole-school observations, pre-lesson interviews, classroom observations, post-lesson interviews with video-stimulated recall, observation notes, and site document review. The interpretation and analysis of the data involved cross-checking different sources of evidence. Braun and Clarke's (2006) thematic analysis was employed in the analysis of the data.

The analysis of the data revealed that subject teachers held multiple and competing language ideologies about English language use which were manifested in classroom practices. However, teachers' stated language ideologies were not always in alignment with their language practices. The school context impacted on teachers' actions and decision-making on the use of English in the classrooms and in the school. The multiplicity and contested language ideologies circulating in the school promoted and inhibited teachers' use of English.

The study offers deeper insights into the complexity of the implementation of English bilingual education in the selected government-owned school. With regard to the empirical implications of the current study, I propose some suggestions which should be taken into account when establishing English bilingual education, particularly if it is top-down policy.

CERTIFICATION OF DISSERTATION

I, Sri Wuli Fitriati, hereby certify that the ideas, experimental work, results, analyses, and conclusions reported in this dissertation are entirely my own effort, except where otherwise acknowledged. I also certify that the work is original and has not been previously submitted for any other award, except where otherwise acknowledged.



Signature of Candidate

28th February 2015

Date

ENDORSEMENT



Signature of Supervisor

February 28, 2015

Date



Signature of Supervisor

March 1, 2015

Date

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Alhamdulillahirobbilalamin. All the praises be to Allah, the Lord of the 'Alamîn. Thank you Allah Subhanahu wa taala the Most Gracious and the Most Merciful, for all blessings given to me; I finally have completed my study.

This work would not have been possible without the support of many people. I would like to extend my sincere gratitude: First of all, I am indebted to my university where I have been teaching, Semarang State University (*Universitas Negeri Semarang*), to the Rector, the Dean of the Faculty of Languages and Arts, and the Head of the English Language and Literature Department, for giving me permission and support to undertake Postgraduate studies in Australia.

I would like to acknowledge the support of Directorate General of Higher Education, Ministry of Education and Culture of the Republic of Indonesia (*Direktorat Jenderal Pendidikan Tinggi, Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan, Republik Indonesia*) which provided me with a scholarship and made possible for me to take Postgraduate studies in the University of Southern Queensland (USQ), in Toowoomba, Queensland, Australia.

My sincere appreciation goes to the school executives who agreed to support my study and all teacher participants in my research. My thanks also go to other members of the school who willingly shared their conversations with me.

My sincere gratitude is also for Professor Patrick Danaher the Associate Dean of Research at the Faculty of Business, Education, Law and Arts, University of Southern Queensland, for the Postgraduate and Early Career Research Group's (PGECR) useful discussions. Even though I was not always able to join the group's meetings, once I had a very good opportunity to present my research project proposal in a PGECR symposium and got supportive feedback from the group. I owe thank you to Professor Patrick Danaher who encouraged me to take part writing a book chapter in the edited book titled *Educational innovations and contemporary technologies*.

My bunch of thanks goes to Cristy Bartlett, the senior academic support officer at the Faculty of Business, Education, Law and Arts who assisted me sincerely since the beginning of my application process to be a research student, enrolment, confirmation of candidature, submitting this dissertation, and other detailed administrative matters during my study.

I thank Dr Kerry Taylor-Leech for the early conceptualization of ideologies and for being helpful in the preparation of my research proposal until my confirmation of candidature. I wish her a further successful career in the Griffith University.

Two people to whom I owe especial gratitude are my supervisors Doctor Ann Dashwood and Associate Professor Robyn Henderson for their constructive feedback and whose critical insights and guidance were a major contribution to my research. Thank you, Robyn for the fruitful discussions in Doc Chats, a round-table informal discussions for the faculty research students. Ann and Robyn, you both are two influencing people whom I also shared my personal stories about my family, my up and down journey of this PhD studies. You are the inspiration for me to be a better lecturer and a researcher.

Friends of mine, research students in the G 422 office, thank you for stories we shared and for giving motivation and optimism to each other. Especially for Cristine Hall, thank you my dear friend. It was nice for having a friendship with you. My dear sisters and brothers and their families, especially mbak Sri Rejeki Urip and mbak Sri Lestari, thank you for your special caring, attention and love for my two children when I was away from our home country for the first three months of my stay in Australia, and when I carried out the fieldwork in the home country. Our late mother and father, Ibuk Maryati almarhumah and Bapak Sariman Moch Asrori almarhum, must have been very happy and proud of you as loving me, your youngest sibling, so much.

The biggest thank you of all goes to my family, Amir my husband and Muna Aulida and Fayaquna Wardah Islamadina our two daughters. You all have shown amazing patience, support, and self-sacrifice during these long years. Muna and Aya, my angels who always cheered me up and made me laugh, thank you and lots of kisses and hugs from Mommy. To my Bang Amir wonderful husband, without you I could never have completed this work. You support me endlessly, even through the hardest time. You have taught me much about courage, perseverance and positive thinking.

Finally, I would like to extend a special thank you to my parents-in-law, Ibuk Barkah and Abah Muhammad Salim for always praying for me, supporting, and believing me. Thank you for giving me your son.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract	ii
Certification of dissertation	iv
Acknowledgements	v
Table of contents	vii
List of tables	x
Publication	xi

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

Introduction to the study	1
My personal story: My starting point	2
Aims of the study	4
Research questions	4
Overview of this dissertation.....	4
Summary	5

CHAPTER 2: THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK AND LITERATURE REVIEW

Language ideologies as a theoretical lens for the study	6
Introduction	6
Definitions of language ideologies.....	6
Conceptual foundations of language ideologies.....	8
Methods in investigating language ideologies	10
Teachers' language ideologies	12
Summary	13
Literature review	13
Introduction	13
Some prevalent English language ideologies in global context.....	13
Current status and role of English in Indonesia	17
Context for this study	19
Controversies over the use of English in Mathematics and Science subjects	20
Research on the use of English in government-selected school	22
Bilingual education: Definitions	28
Prevalent language practice in bilingual and multilingual classrooms.....	31
Drawing together the literature	35
Summary	36

CHAPTER 3: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

Introduction	37
Revisiting research questions and purposes of the study	37
Framing the current study: An ethnographic case study	38
The study	39
A state senior high school: The research site	39
Access to the site	41
The participants	42
Roles of the researcher	43
Reciprocity	43
Reflexivity	45
Data sources and data collection methods.....	45
Whole-school observations	46
Classroom observations.....	46
Observation notes	47
In-depth interviews.....	48
Site document review	49
Data analysis	49
Issues of transcription and translation	53
Trustworthiness	54
Summary	54

CHAPTER 4: TEACHERS' LANGUAGE IDEOLOGIES ABOUT ENGLISH

Introduction	55
Subject teachers' language ideologies about English.....	55
Language ideology 1: Using English is a heavy burden	55
Language ideology 2: We have our own language	61
Language ideology 3: English is the international language.....	64
Language ideology 4: English benefits students in the future.....	66
Language ideology 5: Using English will not decrease our nationalism	68
Multiple and often competing teachers' English language ideologies	71
Summary	75

CHAPTER 5: SUBJECT TEACHERS' INTERACTIONAL AND PEDAGOGICAL PRACTICES IN CLASSROOMS

Introduction	76
Interactional and pedagogical practices in classrooms	76
Teachers' use of codeswitching	76
Teachers allowed students to codeswitch.....	81
Teachers' unawareness of their English language errors	85
Safetalk practices in classrooms.....	86
English-medium PowerPoint as a useful tool to teach subjects bilingually	91
Cooperative learning	92
Manifestations of teachers' language ideologies in their classroom practices.....	94

Summary	97
---------------	----

CHAPTER 6: SCHOOL EXECUTIVES' LANGUAGE IDEOLOGIES ABOUT ENGLISH

Introduction	98
School executives' English language ideologies	98
Language ideology 1: English is the international language.....	98
Language ideology 2: English advances an individual's professional repertoire	101
Language ideology 3: English is not a common language in daily life	103
Language ideology 4: Using English will not decrease our nationalism	106
Different language ideologies regarding creating habitual English language use in school.....	108
Impact of prevailing English language ideologies circulated in school on teachers' classroom language practices	110
Summary	112

CHAPTER 7: CONCLUSION

Introduction	114
Summary of main findings	114
Contributions to knowledge	118
Limitations of the study.....	119
The way forward.....	120
Direction for future research	120
Closing remarks.....	121

APPENDICES

Appendix A	Ethical clearance approval
Appendix B	Participant information sheet
Appendix C	Consent form
Appendix D	Pre-lesson interview guide for teachers
Appendix E	Post-lesson interview guide for teachers
Appendix F	Classroom observation sheet
Appendix G	Interview guide for school executives
Appendix H	Sample of a Mathematics lesson plan

REFERENCES

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1	Schedule of classroom observations.....	46
Table 2	An example of data extract, with codes applied.....	50-51
Table 3	An example of data extract, with codes and potential themes applied.....	51-52

PUBLICATION

The following book chapter has been based on sections of this dissertation and its data.

Fitriati, S. W. (in press). Considering teachers' language ideologies as implicated in a failed innovation. In P. Redmond, J. Lock, P. A. Danaher (Eds), *Educational innovations and contemporary technologies*. Hampshire, U.K.: Palgrave Macmillan.