

Lynda Crowley-Cyr

Homelessness, Mental Illness and the State

Lynda Crowley-Cyr

Homelessness, Mental Illness and the State

An Endless Crisis of Suffering and Exclusion

VDM Verlag Dr. Müller

Impressum/Imprint (nur für Deutschland/ only for Germany)

Bibliografische Information der Deutschen Nationalbibliothek: Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek verzeichnet diese Publikation in der Deutschen Nationalbibliografie; detaillierte bibliografische Daten sind im Internet über <http://dnb.d-nb.de> abrufbar.

Alle in diesem Buch genannten Marken und Produktnamen unterliegen warenzeichen-, marken- oder patentrechtlichem Schutz bzw. sind Warenzeichen oder eingetragene Warenzeichen der jeweiligen Inhaber. Die Wiedergabe von Marken, Produktnamen, Gebrauchsnamen, Handelsnamen, Warenbezeichnungen u.s.w. in diesem Werk berechtigt auch ohne besondere Kennzeichnung nicht zu der Annahme, dass solche Namen im Sinne der Warenzeichen- und Markenschutzgesetzgebung als frei zu betrachten wären und daher von jedermann benutzt werden dürften.

Coverbild: www.purestockx.com

Verlag: VDM Verlag Dr. Müller Aktiengesellschaft & Co. KG
Dudweiler Landstr. 99, 66123 Saarbrücken, Deutschland
Telefon +49 681 9100-698, Telefax +49 681 9100-988, Email: info@vdm-verlag.de
Zugl.: Sydney, University of Sydney, PhD Diss., 2008

Herstellung in Deutschland:
Schaltungsdienst Lange o.H.G., Berlin
Books on Demand GmbH, Norderstedt
Reha GmbH, Saarbrücken
Amazon Distribution GmbH, Leipzig
ISBN: 978-3-639-24633-9

Imprint (only for USA, GB)

Bibliographic information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek: The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available in the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>.

Any brand names and product names mentioned in this book are subject to trademark, brand or patent protection and are trademarks or registered trademarks of their respective holders. The use of brand names, product names, common names, trade names, product descriptions etc. even without a particular marking in this work is in no way to be construed to mean that such names may be regarded as unrestricted in respect of trademark and brand protection legislation and could thus be used by anyone.

Cover image: www.purestockx.com

Publisher:
VDM Verlag Dr. Müller Aktiengesellschaft & Co. KG
Dudweiler Landstr. 99, 66123 Saarbrücken, Germany
Phone +49 681 9100-698, Fax +49 681 9100-988, Email: info@vdm-publishing.com

Copyright © 2010 by the author and VDM Verlag Dr. Müller Aktiengesellschaft & Co. KG and licensors
All rights reserved. Saarbrücken 2010

Printed in the U.S.A.
Printed in the U.K. by (see last page)
ISBN: 978-3-639-24633-9

Acknowledgements

My heartfelt thanks to Professor Terry Carney and my dear friend and mentor Professor Paul Havemann for their unfailing support and inspirational guidance in the development of this work. To my family and friends, thank you for your patience, love and understanding, in particular to my sister and best friend Carole, and partner Mario for providing me with such a peaceful place to live, think and work; and to my copy editor Ellen, your efforts are much appreciated.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1	INTRODUCTION	1
1.1	Aims and Questions.....	5
1.2	Some Definitions, Organising Concepts, and Themes	8
1.2.1	<i>Modernity, Displacement and Wasted Lives</i>	8
1.2.2	<i>Homelessness, Mental Illness and Disability</i>	11
i.	Homelessness	11
ii.	Mental Illness	12
iii.	Disability	13
1.2.3	<i>Social Exclusion, Social Protection and Social Control</i>	14
1.3	Book Outlined: Parts and Chapters	16
1.3.1	<i>Part One (Chapters 1, 2, 3)</i>	18
1.3.2	<i>Part Two (Chapters 4, 5, 6)</i>	19
1.3.3	<i>Part Three (Chapters 7, 8, 9)</i>	23
1.4	What Follows	27
CHAPTER 2	'MISCOUNTING' AND 'DISCOUNTING' HOMELESSNESS	28
2.1	Introduction	28
2.1.1	<i>The Concept of Denial</i>	31
2.1.2	<i>Techniques of Denial</i>	32
2.2	Homelessness in Australia	33
2.2.1	<i>Homeless 'Specialty Communities'</i>	34
2.2.2	<i>Multiple Disadvantage</i>	36
2.2.3	<i>Evidence-Based Responses</i>	37
2.3	Counting the Homeless.....	38
2.3.1	<i>The ABS Approach</i>	39
2.3.2	<i>The SAAP Approach</i>	39
2.3.3	<i>Inconsistent Meanings and Data</i>	41
2.3.4	<i>Methodological Complexities</i>	43
i.	Flaws in the 1996 Count	44
ii.	Flaws in the 2001 and 2006 Counts.....	45
iii.	Flaws with SAAP Data	47
	Table 2.2: Number of individuals recorded as homeless in 1996-1997 in New South Wales and Queensland and the amount of SAAP funding received by those States.....	49
2.3.5	<i>Miscounting as Discounting</i>	50
2.4	Redefining Homelessness	51
2.4.1	<i>The Meaning of 'Home'</i>	53
i.	Is Homelessness Houselessness?.....	54
ii.	The 'x Factor'	55
2.4.2	<i>Key Dimensions of Homelessness</i>	55

i.	The Accommodation Dimension	56
ii.	The Temporal Dimension	56
iii.	The Notion of Iterative Homelessness	58
iv.	The Quality Dimension	60
2.5	Conclusion	60
CHAPTER 3	'HOME'-LESSNESS AND MENTAL ILLNESS	64
3.1	Introduction	64
3.2	Modernity and 'Wasted Lives'	65
3.2.1	<i>Homeless People with Mental Illness</i>	68
3.3	The Idea of Social Exclusion	70
3.3.1	<i>Moving Beyond Economics?</i>	72
3.3.2	<i>'Exclusion' and Disadvantage</i>	72
3.4	Exclusion, Homelessness and Suffering	73
3.4.1	<i>Poor Housing and Physical Suffering</i>	74
3.4.2	<i>Poor Housing and Mental Suffering</i>	78
3.5	Dimensions of Home	79
3.5.1	<i>Material Insecurity as Suffering</i>	80
3.5.2	<i>Ontological Insecurity as Suffering</i>	81
i.	The Role of the Media	82
ii.	Multiple Stigma	84
iii.	Labels	85
3.5.3	<i>The Role of the Law: Repression and Emancipation</i>	86
3.6	Personal Insecurity as Suffering	88
3.6.1	<i>Victimisation</i>	88
3.6.2	<i>Hate Crimes</i>	89
3.7	Exclusion from Legal Services	91
3.7.1	<i>Housing Disputes</i>	92
3.7.2	<i>Offences Linked to Homelessness and Mental Illness</i>	94
i.	Multiple Disadvantages	95
ii.	Fines as Punishment	96
iii.	Specialist Courts and Training	97
iv.	Move-on Laws	97
v.	Placelessness	100
3.8	Conclusion	101
PART II - DISPLACEMENT IN MODERNITY: A HISTORY		105
Displacement		105
Modernity and the Intractable Crisis		106
Modernity and Exclusion		108
The Great Incarcerations		111
Deinstitutionalisation		112
Unintended Consequences of Change		114
CHAPTER 4	INSTITUTIONALISATION AND DEINSTITUTIONALISATION	116
4.1	Introduction	116
4.2	Cyclical Patterns of 'Reform'	118
4.2.1	<i>Versions of History</i>	119
4.2.2	<i>The Non-Modern 'Inclusive' World</i>	121
4.2.3	<i>Enlightenment, Modernity and the Victory of 'Rationality'</i>	121
4.3	Phase I: Institutionalisation	122
4.3.1	<i>Incarceration as Waste Management</i>	124
i.	Work for Relief	124
ii.	Madness as Idleness	125
4.3.2	<i>The 'Medicalisation' of Madness</i>	127

i.	The Growth of Mental Asylums	128
ii.	The Birth of Psychiatry	129
iii.	The Decay of Asylums and Psychiatry	130
4.3.3	<i>Twentieth Century 'Care' and Treatment</i>	131
i.	The Pharmacological Revolution	132
4.3.4	<i>'Unintended Consequences' of Early 'Reforms'</i>	133
4.4	Logics of Twentieth Century Transformation.....	134
4.4.1	<i>'Isms' and 'Modernities'</i>	134
4.4.2	<i>De-traditionalisation of Society</i>	135
4.4.3	<i>The Human Rights Revolution</i>	136
4.5	Phase II: Deinstitutionalisation	138
4.5.1	<i>The Reconceptualisation of Health</i>	139
4.5.2	<i>Pharmacological and Psychological Advancements</i>	141
4.6	Conclusion	142
CHAPTER 5 'CARE' IN THE COMMUNITY		145
5.1	Introduction	145
5.2	The Shift to Community-Based Mental Health Care	147
5.2.1	<i>The Process as 'Fishing'</i>	149
5.2.2	<i>A Coalition of Ideologies</i>	150
5.3	Reports on Community 'Care': Progress or Regress?.....	152
5.3.1	<i>Trends in Mental Health Service Delivery (early 1990s to early 2000s)</i>	154
i.	Mainstreaming	154
ii.	Downsizing Psychiatric Beds.....	155
iii.	Over Shrinkage: a Nationwide Problem	156
iv.	Possible Miscounting?	157
v.	Mainstreaming as Exclusion	158
5.3.2	<i>Fiscal Considerations in Shifting Expenditure</i>	158
i.	Monitoring Costs of Mental Illness	159
ii.	The Cost of Homelessness	161
iii.	Hidden Costs	162
5.3.3	<i>Towards Crisis Care</i>	162
i.	Ongoing Stigma and Discrimination	163
5.4	Growth in Demand for Third Sector Services.....	164
5.4.1	<i>Concerns in a Changing Environment</i>	166
i.	Inadequate Training	168
5.5	Trends in Mental Health and Service Delivery in the New Millennium	170
5.5.1	<i>Evidence of Ongoing Services Delivery Problems</i>	171
5.5.2	<i>Government Pledges of Assistance</i>	172
5.6	The Homelessness Connection.....	174
5.6.1	<i>Mental Health and Homelessness Funding Initiatives</i>	177
5.7	Conclusion	178
CHAPTER 6 AFTER THE WELFARE STATE: ORBITS OF HOMELESSNESS		183
6.1	Introduction	183
6.2	From 'Welfare' State to Enterprising State.....	186
6.2.1	<i>The 'Deconstruction' of the Welfare State</i>	188
i.	The New Right and Rise of the Enterprising State.....	189
ii.	The New Public Management	191
6.2.2	<i>Social Transitions in the Social 'Crisis' Era</i>	192
i.	'Social Protection' in Jeopardy	194
ii.	Homeless Mentally Ill People Surviving the Transition.....	195
6.3	Sites of Exclusion within Orbits of Homelessness.....	198
6.3.1	<i>'Inner' Orbits of Homelessness</i>	201

i.	Prisons as ‘Dumpsites’	202
ii.	Immigration Detention Centres as ‘Dumpsites’	205
6.3.2	<i>‘Outer’ Orbits of Homelessness</i>	208
6.3.3	<i>Mentally Ill, Homeless and Placeless</i>	209
6.4	Conclusion	209
PART III - MODERNITY AND GOVERNANCE		211
	Dynamics of Governance Regimes	213
	Transformations Synonymous with the Enterprising of the State	215
	Disillusionment with the Bureaucratic Approach	217
	Transformations Synonymous with the Enterprising of the State	218
	Australia’s Distinct Process	220
	Sectoral Displacement: From Public to Private to Third Sector Service Delivery	222
CHAPTER 7 HOUSING OPTIONS IN THE ENTERPRISING STATE		225
7.1	Introduction	225
7.2	The Rise of Public Housing	228
7.2.1	<i>Problems with Welfare State Housing</i>	229
7.3	Restructuring Public Sector Governance	229
7.3.1	<i>Less ‘Rowing’: Housing Stock Sales</i>	231
7.3.2	<i>More ‘Steering’: Outsourcing</i>	232
i.	Social Housing	233
ii.	Australian Social Housing	234
7.4	Sector Restructuring Played Out in the ‘Life World’	234
7.4.1	<i>Still Waiting for Housing</i>	235
7.4.2	<i>Still ‘Rationing’ Shelter</i>	237
7.5	A Duty to House and the Creation of Rights—A Step Forward?	238
7.5.1	<i>Reconceptualising Homelessness</i>	239
7.5.2	<i>‘One Step Forward, Two Steps Back’</i>	240
7.5.3	<i>Targeting as Bad Client Service</i>	241
i.	Existing Clients: Creating Conflict	242
ii.	New Clients: Escalating Eligibility Criteria	242
iii.	Fewer Future Clients	243
7.5.4	<i>Reinforcing Marginalisation</i>	244
7.6	Enterprising State Shrinkage of Housing Options	244
7.6.1	<i>Affordable Rental Housing</i>	246
7.6.2	<i>Boarding Houses</i>	247
7.6.3	<i>The Changing Character of Residents</i>	248
i.	‘Working poor’	249
ii.	‘Nouveau poor’	249
iii.	Homeless Mentally Disabled Boarders	252
7.6.4	<i>Poor Standards and Operators</i>	253
7.6.5	<i>Violence</i>	254
7.7	Impacts of Sectoral Displacement	256
7.7.1	<i>Asking for Charity</i>	256
7.7.2	<i>‘Hidden’ Consequences</i>	258
7.7.3	<i>Unmet Need</i>	259
7.8	Conclusion	260
CHAPTER 8 CONTRACTUALISM ‘IN’ ACTION		263
8.1	Introduction	263
8.2	The Rise of Regulation of Low-cost Housing	265
8.3	Changes in Queensland	269
8.3.1	<i>Municipal Model</i>	269
i.	A Call for Better Regulation	270

ii.	The Exposé.....	271
iii.	Poor Supporting Laws.....	273
8.3.2	<i>State Government Model</i>	274
8.4	The Creation of a Residential Services Industry.....	275
8.4.1	<i>Regulating the 'Rowing'</i>	276
i.	Enforcing Compliance: 'Sticks' and 'Carrots'.....	278
ii.	Economic Incentives as Carrots.....	279
8.4.2	<i>Regulating Relationships</i>	280
i.	Residential Services Agreements Creating Rights and Responsibilities.....	280
ii.	Problems with the Law Itself.....	281
iii.	An Unlevel Playing Field.....	283
8.4.3	<i>The Myth of Rights</i>	284
i.	Problems of Access.....	285
ii.	Disempowered People.....	285
iii.	Fear of Retribution.....	286
8.4.4	<i>Quality Assurance</i>	287
i.	Competing Interests.....	288
8.5	Contractualism: Blurring Rights and Responsibilities.....	289
8.5.1	<i>The Purchase of Low-cost Housing: Relationships 1 & 3</i>	290
8.5.2	<i>The Purchase of Support Services: Relationship 2</i>	293
i.	Monitoring Performance and Free-Riding.....	294
8.5.3	<i>Funding Welfare Services: Relationships 4 & 5</i>	295
8.5.4	<i>Monitoring Registration and Accreditation: Relationship 6</i>	296
8.5.5	<i>Protecting Interests of Homeless Mentally Ill Residents: Relationship 7</i>	297
i.	Neglect and Cover-ups.....	297
ii.	Information Asymmetry.....	298
8.6	The Next Step in the Process.....	298
8.7	Conclusion.....	300
CHAPTER 9 SOCIAL POLICY, DISPLACEMENT AND THE 'THIRD' SECTOR.....		304
9.1	Introduction.....	304
9.2	The Enterprising State and Social Policy.....	305
9.3	The Rise of Welfare Policy.....	309
9.3.1	<i>The Idea of Human Need</i>	310
i.	'Basic' v 'Real' Needs.....	311
ii.	The Relevance of Subjectivity.....	313
iii.	The Relevance of Language & Communication.....	313
iv.	The Relevance of Ideology.....	315
9.3.2	<i>Economic Rationalism</i>	316
9.3.3	<i>The Idea of Housing as a Social Right</i>	317
9.4	Displacement and the 'Third Sector'.....	321
9.4.1	<i>Mismatch between Need and SAAP Funding</i>	324
9.5	Displacement of Caring on Families.....	325
9.5.1	<i>Inadequate Access to Support Services</i>	327
9.5.2	<i>Impacts on Carers' Health and Quality of Life</i>	329
9.5.3	<i>Relationship Breakdowns and Homelessness</i>	331
9.5.4	<i>Dual Work/Care Pressures</i>	332
9.6	Displacement of Informal Care on Volunteers.....	334
9.6.1	<i>Financial and Distance Impediments</i>	336
9.6.2	<i>An Uncertain Future</i>	337
9.6.3	<i>Collaboration in Service Delivery</i>	340
9.7	Towards a Coalition of Sectors.....	341
9.7.1	<i>Finding a Voice</i>	342

9.8	Conclusion	343
<i>CHAPTER 10 CONCLUSION</i>		347
10.1	Preamble	347
10.2	Summary of Parts and Chapters	348
10.2.1	<i>Lessons from the Past: Altering Assumptions</i>	356
10.3	Strategies for Mitigating the Suffering	357
10.3.1	<i>Address Discriminating Attitudes and Beliefs</i>	362
10.3.2	<i>Promote Employment Opportunities</i>	365
10.3.3	<i>Family Support and Community Participation</i>	367
10.3.4	<i>Address Housing, Financial and Legal Issues, Transport, Information and Access</i>	369
10.4	Reflections on Limitations and Value of the Research	372
10.5	Concluding Remarks	373
<i>BIBLIOGRAPHY</i>		375

LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES

TABLES:

Table 2.1: <i>Rate of homeless persons per 10,000 in 1996 and percentage in SAAP funded accommodation</i>	48
Table 2.2: <i>Number of individuals recorded as homeless in 1996-1997 in New South Wales and Queensland and the amount of SAAP funding received by those States</i>	49
Table 3.1: <i>Physical and Mental Health Implications of Sleeping Rough or In Low-cost Housing</i>	77
Table II-0.1: <i>Modernity Grid</i>	107
Table 4.1: <i>Key Transformations in the Care and Control of Homeless Mentally Ill People</i>	119
Table 6.1: <i>Competing Theories of the State in Modernity</i>	187
Table 6.2: <i>Impacts of the Transitions from Fordism to post-Fordism on the Mentally Ill Homeless</i> ..	197
Table III.1: <i>The Keynesian Welfare State—Mostly Procedural Governance</i>	214
Table III.2: <i>Enterprising State—Governance based on Market Principles</i>	215
Table III.3: <i>Approaches to Welfare Administration</i>	216
Table 9.1: <i>Models of Social Policy</i>	307

FIGURES:

Figure II.1: <i>System displacement (physical/geographical movement)</i>	106
Figure 6.1: <i>Orbit of Homelessness</i>	199
Figure 6.2: <i>Basic Orbit of Homelessness</i>	200
Figure 6.3: <i>Inner Orbits of Homelessness Travelled by Some Mentally Ill People</i>	201
Figure 6.4: <i>Outer orbit of Homelessness Travelled by Mentally Ill Foreigners</i>	208
Figure III.1: <i>System and Sectoral Displacement</i>	223
Figure 7.1: <i>The Displacement Process</i>	257
Figure 8.1: <i>Contractualism in the Residential Services Industry</i>	291

Figure 8.2: <i>Simple Residential Services Contracts</i>	292
Figure 8.3: <i>Third Party Residential Services Contracts</i>	292
Figure 8.4: <i>Complex Service Purchase Arrangements</i>	294